STATE OF INDIANA

DEPARTMENT OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT FINANCE



INDIANA GOVERNMENT CENTER NORTH 100 NORTH SENATE AVENUE N1058(B) INDIANAPOLIS, IN 46204 PHONE (317) 232-3777 FAX (317) 232-8779

TO:

Assessing Officials

FROM:

Barry Wood, Assessment Division Director & W

RE:

Golf Course Guidance

DATE:

March 15, 2012

Starting with the March 1, 2012 assessment, IC 6-1.1-4-42(e), requires the Department of Local Government Finance (the "Department") to establish uniform capitalization tables and procedures to be used for the assessment of golf courses. These tables will be formally promulgated in a future administrative rule.

"Golf course" means an area of land and yard improvements that are predominately used to play the game of golf. A golf course consists of a series of holes, each consisting of a teeing area, fairway, rough and other hazards, and the green with the pin and cup. IC 6-1.1-4-42(b).

Assessing officials must use the tables and procedures adopted by the Department to assess, reassess, and annually adjust the value of golf courses. Please note, the Department has previously issued guidance regarding the assessment of golf courses (see http://www.in.gov/dlgf/files/090817 - Wood Memo - Valuation of Golf Courses - Legislative Changes.pdf; http://www.in.gov/dlgf/files/091215 - Wood Memo - Golf Course Supplement.pdf; and http://www.in.gov/dlgf/files/110505 - Wood Memo - Golf Course Guidance.pdf).

Indiana Code 6-1.1-4-42(c)(3) excludes from the true tax value the value of personal property, intangible property, and income derived from personal or intangible property such as course naming rights. The Department has interpreted this statute to exclude the income derived from the rental of golf carts from the income capitalization approach to valuation. The Department believes this would be applicable to pro shop income as well.

The Income Capitalization approach is one of three approaches to the valuation of real property. The appraiser derives a value indication for income-producing property by converting the anticipated benefits through ownership of property. (Source: International Association of Assessing Officers — Course #102 "Income Approach to Valuation"). It is based on the economic principles of:

- Anticipation
- Change
- Supply and demand and competition
- Substitution
- Balance and contribution

Basis of Income:

For a golf course, there may be several different sources of income, including greens fees, membership dues, concessions, and other miscellaneous sources. Assessing officials should solicit data for gross income and allowable operating expenses from the golf course operators and use federal tax returns or similar evidence as verification that the submissions are correct. This should be utilized when submitted numbers are out of line with those of similarly situated competitors. Additionally, the financial records and federal tax return(s) of the taxpayer should be carefully scrutinized to ensure the appropriate income and expense information for the subject property is utilized.

Income and Expense Statement:

Income and expense information obtained from the golf course operator may or may not include the information below. If the information from the owner's statement(s) is available, the assessing official should strive to reconstruct it into the following format:

- Gross Income (potential gross income)
- Miscellaneous Income
- Effective Gross Income
- Allowable Expenses:
 - Operating
 - Replacement Reserves
 - Real Estate taxes (deducted under certain conditions, for example, when calculating for property tax purposes)
 - Management fees/expense
 - Insurance
 - Salaries
 - Benefits
 - Utilities
 - Advertising
 - Repairs
 - Supplies
 - Legal and Accounting Fees
 - Miscellaneous Expenses
 - Replacement Reserves
- Non-allowable expenses:
 - Depreciation (reflected in the recapture rate)
 - Capital improvements
 - Franchise fees and special corporation costs
 - Owner's personal expenses (income taxes, etc.)
 - Debt service (principal and interest on mortgage)
 - Payments on loans for capital improvements
 - Real Estate taxes (not deducted as an expense under certain conditions reflected in the effective tax rate).

Utilizing income and expense information from the local golf course(s), the assessing official should use the following steps to determine the valuation:

- Step One: Determine Potential Gross Income
- Step Two: Add miscellaneous income
- Step Three: Potential Gross Income plus miscellaneous income = Effective Gross Income (EGI)
- Step Four: Deduct Expenses and Replacement Reserves
- Step Five: Effective Gross Income less Expenses and Replacement Reserves = Net Operating Income
- Step Six: Divide Net Operating Income by the Overall Capitalization Rate = Assessed Value

The income and expense information will vary from course to course, particularly in the detail provided. For those courses where detailed income and expense information may not be available, but information such as ordinary income, depreciation, interest expense, entertainment (if any), and golf cart income (less expenses) – see page 4 of http://www.in.gov/dlgf/files/110505 – Wood Memo - Golf Course Guidance.pdf is available, it should be utilized to determine the assessed value.

The following example is used for illustrative purposes, and does not represent an actual golf course or financial information from a golf course:

Income and Expense Statement for the "Missing Links" Course:

INCOME	2011	2010	2009	3-Year Average
Rounds Played	1,000	900	950	•
GOLF INCOME				
Green Fees	\$33,000	\$32,000	\$33,500	
Annual Golfing				
Member Dues	\$75,000	\$68,000	\$70,000	
Driving Range	\$10,500	\$8,750	\$9,000	
Miniature Golf Sales	\$8,500	\$7,000	\$7,800	
Club Storage	\$1,200	\$900	\$1,000	
Total Golf EGI	\$128,200	\$116,650	\$121,300	\$122,050
NON-GOLF INCOM	IE 2011	2010	2009	3-Year Average
NON-GOLF INCOM Food & Beverage	IE 2011	2010	2009	3-Year Average
	S37,500	2010 \$35,000	2009 \$36,000	3-Year Average
Food & Beverage				3-Year Average
Food & Beverage Sales				3-Year Average
Food & Beverage Sales Annual Non-Golfing	\$37,500	\$35,000	\$36,000	3-Year Average
Food & Beverage Sales Annual Non-Golfing Member Dues	\$37,500 \$16,000	\$35,000 \$13,000	\$36,000 \$14,500	3-Year Average
Food & Beverage Sales Annual Non-Golfing Member Dues Other Income	\$37,500 \$16,000	\$35,000 \$13,000	\$36,000 \$14,500	3-Year Average \$51,900
Food & Beverage Sales Annual Non-Golfing Member Dues Other Income Total Non-Golf	\$37,500 \$16,000 \$1,200 \$54,700	\$35,000 \$13,000 \$1,000	\$36,000 \$14,500 \$1,500	<u> </u>
Food & Beverage Sales Annual Non-Golfing Member Dues Other Income Total Non-Golf Income	\$37,500 \$16,000 \$1,200 \$54,700	\$35,000 \$13,000 \$1,000	\$36,000 \$14,500 \$1,500	<u>\$51,900</u>

Course Maintenance Course Maintenance	\$16,000	\$15,250)	\$14,750	
Salaries	\$27,000	\$25,500)	\$28,750	
Irrigation	\$7,500	\$7,000		\$6,500	
	ŕ				
GOLF EXPENSES	2011	2010		2009	3-Year Average
Advertising/	2011	2010		2007	5-10m morage
Promotion@ 50%	\$1,000	\$1,000		\$1,000	
Facilities		,			
Insurance @ 25%	\$3,500	\$3,500		\$3,500	
Management @ 10%					
Golf EGI	\$12,820	\$11,665	5	\$12,130	
Replacement		64 600		#1.000	
Reserves @ \$2/round		\$1,800	_	\$1,900	ቀረፅ ሰንን
Total Golf Expenses	\$69,820	\$65,715)	\$68,530	\$68,022
Non-Golf Expenses	2011	2010		2009	3-Year Average
Other Real Estate					C
Maintenance	\$5,000	\$3,500		\$4,750	
Other Salaries	\$30,000	\$27,800	C	\$29,250	
Other Utilities	\$5,500	\$5,000		\$4,750	
Advertising					
/Promotion @ 50%	\$1,000	\$1,000		\$1,000	
Facilities Insurance			_	640.500	
@ 75%	\$10,500	\$10,500	0	\$10,500	
Cost of Food/	#140 50	#12 #0	^	e17 000	
Beverage Sales	\$14,250	\$13,500	U	\$16,000	
Management @	\$5,470	\$4,900		\$5,200	
10% Non-Golf EGI	\$3,470	\$4,500		\$5,200	
Total Non-Golf Expenses	\$71,720	\$66,20	0	\$71,450	\$69,790
Lapenses	Ψ/1,/20	Ψ00,20	O	φ, 1, 120	4003,000
Total Enterprise Expe	enses				\$137,812
Total Enterprise NOI			\$36,13	38	
Capitalize @ 13%*			\$277,		
Market Value-In-Use of Real Estate \$278,000 (rounded)					
* Capitalization rate for illustrative purposes only.					

Capitalization Rate:

Determining the Net Operating Income (NOI) is a key determinant in establishing the value of a property in the income approach. The other key component that may have a significant effect on the total value of the property is the capitalization rate. The "Overall Capitalization Rate" (OAR) expresses the relationship between net operating income and the market value of the property. It can be developed using the following:

- Market Extraction
- Effective Tax Rate
- Mortgage & Equity
- Discounted Cash Flow

The OAR reflects risk, liquidity (or lack thereof), potential for growth in net income, and general requirements of the investor. **The OAR is listed separately for each county on the attached sheet.** To determine the value of the property (simplistically), divide the Net Operating Income by the Overall Rate.

General Notes:

Three (3) years of income and expense information is preferable; however, some information may be limited. If, for whatever reason, the assessing official is not able to obtain income and expense information from their local course(s), there are a few options: 1) the leadership of the Indiana Golf Course Owners Association has indicated they would be willing to follow-up with those courses that refuse to provide the information. Please contact Barry Wood with the course name and location; 2) If you have more than one course in your county, and you have income and expense information from them, you could use that information to help establish a value (the information should be reviewed and adjustments made if necessary); 3) If there is only one course in the jurisdiction, check with surrounding counties to find comparable golf courses and use their information to estimate the assessed value (adjustments may need to be made). Other resources, like appraisals, may also be used in the process to derive a value.

The issue of a zero or negative assessment as a result of a negative NOI has also caused confusion. In those situations where there is a negative NOI, the assessor should first carefully review the financial information to ensure that all income and expense information is accurate. Although each situation is different, great deference is given to local control. The assessing official should strive to work with the golf course to determine an equitable solution in those instances where there is still a negative value after the review.

Finally, apparently there have been some instances where the assessing official has not changed the assessed value even though the income valuation approach warrants a change. As part of the general reassessment, and the annual adjustment process, each assessment year stands alone. Although there may be instances where the assessed value does not change from one year to the next, the assessing official should review the income and expense information (if available) to determine if a change is warranted, and not simply carry-over the assessed value.

If you have any questions, please contact your Assessment Division Field Representative or Assessment Division Director, Barry Wood at Bwood@dlgf.in.gov or 317.232.3762.

CountyNum	County	2012 Proposed Cap Rate
-	Adams	12.00%
_	Allen	12.00%
_	Bartholomew	12.00%
_	Benton	12.00%
	Blackford	12.00%
	Boone	12.00%
_	Brown	12.00%
8	Carroll	12.00%
	Cass	12.00%
_	Clark	12.00%
	Clay	12.00%
	Clinton	12.00%
	Crawford	12.00%
	Daviess	12.00%
15	Dearborn	12.00%
16	Decatur	12.00%
17	Dekalb	12.00%
18	Delaware	12.00%
19	Dubois	12.00%
20	Elkhart	12.00%
	Fayette	12.00%
	Floyd	12.00%
	Fountain	12.00%
	Franklin	12.00%
25	Fulton	12.00%
	Gibson	12.00%
	' Grant	12.00%
28	Greene	12.00%
29	Hamilton	11.50%
30) Hancock	12.00%
31	. Harrison	12.00%
-32	. Hendricks	12.00%
33	Henry	12.00%
	Howard	12.00%
35	Huntington	12.00%
	Jackson	12.00%
37	⁷ Jasper	12.00%
	B Jay	12.00%
39) Jefferson	12.00%
40) Jennings	12.00%
	L Johnson	12.00%
42	2 Knox	12.00%
43	3 Kosciusko	12.00%
44	LaGrange	12.00%
	5 Lake	12.00%
46	î LaPorte	12.00%

47 Lawrence	12.00%
48 Madison	12.00%
49 Marion	12.00%
50 Marshall	12.00%
51 Martin	12.00%
52 Miami	12.00%
53 Monroe	12.00%
54 Montgomery	12.00%
55 Morgan	12.00%
56 Newton	12.00%
57 Noble	12.00%
58 Ohio	12.00%
59 Orange	12.00%
60 Owen	12.00%
61 Parke	12.00%
62 Perry	12.00%
63 Pike	12.00%
64 Porter	12.00%
65 Posey	12.00%
66 Pulaski	12.00%
67 Putnam	12.00%
68 Randolph	12.00%
69 Ripley	12.00%
70 Rush	12.00%
71 St. Joseph	12.00%
72 Scott	12.00%
73 Shelby	12.00%
74 Spencer	12.00%
75 Starke	12.00%
76 Steuben	12.00%
77 Sullivan	12.00%
78 Switzerland	12.00%
79 Tippecanoe	12.00%
80 Tipton	12.00%
81 Union	12.00%
82 Vanderburgh	12.00%
83 Vermillion	12.00%
84 Vigo	11.00%
85 Wabash	12.00%
86 Warren	12.00%
87 Warrick	12.00%
88 Washington	12.00%
89 Wayne	12.00%
90 Wells	12.00%
91 White	12.00%
92 Whitley	12.00%